

## Jacob Gemma

---

**From:** Councillor Steve Curran <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>  
**Sent:** 22 July 2021 11:56  
**To:** Norman Will (Will Norman, Walking & Cycling Commissioner)  
**Subject:** FW: Meeting between TfL and Chiswick residents, 20 February 2020  
**Attachments:** 20 February 2020 Meeting at Palestra to discuss greening.docx

Will

We've done some of the work for you!!

Best wishes

Cllr Steve Curran  
Leader of the Council

Cabinet Member for Corporate Strategy, Planning & Regeneration  
Labour Party Syon Ward  
[REDACTED]

---

**From:** [REDACTED]@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** 22 July 2021 11:54  
**To:** Councillor Steve Curran <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>  
**Cc:** Councillor Hanif Khan <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Katherine Dunne <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Guy Lambert <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Jefferson Nwokeoma <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>  
**Subject:** Fwd: Meeting between TfL and Chiswick residents, 20 February 2020

Thank you Steve

Please see below for the details of the CAVAT calculations and some other comments from that meeting, which were all accepted by TfL at the time. Of course, things changed with the pandemic, but the general principle of replacement and enhancement should be maintained.

I am adding Jefferson in on this, in the hope it will be helpful.

regards

----- Forwarded message -----

**From:** [REDACTED]@gmail.com>  
**Date:** Thu, 20 Feb 2020, 10:34  
**Subject:** Meeting between TfL and Chiswick residents, 20 February 2020  
**To:** Shah Nutan <[REDACTED]@tfl.gov.uk>  
**Cc:** Artis Mark (Engineering) <[REDACTED]@tfl.gov.uk>, Norman Will (Will Norman, Walking & Cycling Commissioner) <[REDACTED]@tfl.gov.uk>, Mark Frost <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>, Councillor Ranjit Gill <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>, [REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>, [REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>, Liam Judge <[REDACTED].co.uk>

Dear Nutan,

Thank you so much for organising yesterday's very positive meeting. I don't have contact details for Dan and Julio, but perhaps you could forward these brief minutes/action points on to them. I include Mark and Liam in the mailing as they are mentioned in the action points!

I think we all came away with a much better understanding of the constraints under which you are working, and I'm very grateful to your team for taking the time to explain this. I hope my understanding of the resulting action points coincide with yours, but please let me know if you feel anything needs correcting.

Best regards

████████

████████████████████  
████████████████

+++

## 20 February 2020 Meeting to discuss greening & tree issues on Chiswick High Road re CW9, Palestra

Chiswick "delegation": [REDACTED], Chiswick resident), Cllr Ranjit Gill (Turnham Green ward), [REDACTED] (Chiswick resident)

TfL: Nutan Shah (principal sponsor CW9), Dan Champion (Healthy Streets lead), Mark Artis (Delivery Engineer CW9), Julio Alvarez (Designer CW9)

### 1. Detailed discussion about the 3 plane trees to be removed

- a. Mayfield Avenue,
- b. 87 Chiswick High Road – outside Parenthood cafe, erstwhile Peppermint shop
- c. Chiswick Lane

Each tree was looked at and the designer and engineer explained why the decision had been made. Cllr Gill thought that one tree (1b) could still be saved, and that Chiswick residents would be willing to sacrifice 5 parking spaces to save the tree. [REDACTED] wasn't sure that would be accepted.

**Action: Cllr Gill to discuss swapping 5 parking spaces for a tree with colleagues, traders and residents.**

### 2. Compensation/mitigation of loss of plane trees

[REDACTED] requested that CAVAT values be applied when calculating the replacement for these 3 trees. While her calculations had been made by a non-professional and should be properly checked, the TfL reps thought that these were in the right ballpark. Details in appendix below, and the spreadsheet can be supplied if helpful. (This does not include the tree outside Windmill Avenue which had to be removed in 2018 due to pipe damage).

These calculations gave the following values:

- a. £50,874
  - b. £96,763
  - c. £96,763
- Total: £244,400

The current suggestion was for around 10 saplings replacement, but [REDACTED] said this was inadequate replacement and requested that CAVAT calculations be used to provide a figure based on this widely accepted method of calculation.

**Action: TfL team to check [REDACTED] calculations and respond with appropriate proposals. Variety and placing of these trees to be discussed with Mark Frost and his 'greening team.'**

### 3. London Borough of Hounslow greening team

The project is being led in Hounslow by Liam Judge, under Mark Frost, Head of Transport. [REDACTED] asked who was in the greening team as she knew the tree and park staff but as far as she was aware they were not working on this. She proposed [REDACTED] as a potential community representative to discuss greening. Cllr Gill also keen to be involved.

**Action [REDACTED] to ask Liam Judge/Mark Frost about composition of greening team. Greening team to include Chiswick representatives.**

### 4. Replanting beds along CW9

The current planting along the High Road, including the beds near Chiswick Lane, is of very poor quality, having been neglected for many years due to the pending CW9 works. TfL confirmed that the replanting formed part of their budget and could be carried out at TfL's cost, but required information from LBH as to preferences. [REDACTED] happy to help, using local landscape gardeners.

**Action: Mark Frost/Liam Judge to liaise with TfL, hopefully with Chiswick representatives, to provide a high quality bio-diverse and aesthetically pleasing solution.**

### 5. Replacing a more mature tree

[REDACTED] enquired whether larger trees could be used to replace the 3 removed. Designer pointed out a large space within a flower bed (outside Chiswick Club Society, 11-13 Chiswick High Road) where he had been thinking a larger tree could be planted. Presumably a replacement plane, as all the other trees along the High Road are London planes.

**Action: Julio to look into planting larger replacement in that position and feed back to [REDACTED]**

### 6. On-going co-operation

TfL had not been able to work directly with Chiswick councillors or residents on CW9, for complex reasons, but this meeting was a sign of a better relationship; all sides were happy to continue co-operation and to work together for a good outcome for the project.

**Action: More co-operation between CW9 LBH team and Chiswick residents re greening action, and between Chiswick residents and TfL where appropriate and helpful.**

\*\*\*

**Appendix: CAVAT values for 3 plane trees**

Cavat (Capital Asset Value for Amenity Trees) values for the 4 x plane trees (3 there, 1 removed in 2017/2018 due burst pipe repairs)

These are amateur assessments – I do not have the expertise to assess the health and longevity so I made conservative estimates. TFL and Hounslow will have formal ratings for these.

Cavat describes amenity value for people who live and work in the area, not environmental services.

See the STEVE tab in the attached which lists the results of using the QUICK calculation

Background and guide on <https://www.ltoa.org.uk/documents-1/capital-asset-value-for-amenity-trees-cavat>

£137,467.00

<b>£50,874</b>
<b>£96,763</b>
<b>£96,763</b>

£381,868.27

Tree	Described in CS9 plans	Age factor	CAVAT	QUICK	circ	radius	dia	dia	CTI	Ft value
Plane Tree, 120 High Road	Windmill Avenue	100	>80	£ 137,467.00	300	47.74648293	95.49296586	85-		Was removed in 2018 due burst pipe fixing
Plane Tree	Mayfield Road	200		£50,874	31.83098862	63.66197724	60-70	125	75	>80
118 High Road		250		£96,763	39.78873577	79.57747155	70-85	125	100	>80
Chiswick Lane		250		£96,763	39.78873577	79.57747155	70-85	125	100	>80

## Jacob Gemma

---

**From:** Norman Will (Will Norman, Walking & Cycling Commissioner)  
**Sent:** 26 July 2021 15:02  
**To:** Councillor Steve Curran  
**Cc:** Councillor Katherine Dunne; Councillor Guy Lambert; Councillor Hanif Khan  
**Subject:** RE: C9 changes

Dear Steve, Hanif, Katherine and Guy

I'm delighted with your decision and appreciate all the hard work you have all put into this. I also really value the great working relationship we have – I wish all boroughs shared your ambition and way of working in partnership.

Thanks for passing on [REDACTED] comments. I will speak to the team and see what we can do.

With best wishes

Will

**Will Norman**  
**Mayor's Walking & Cycling Commissioner**

City Hall | The Queen's Walk | London | SE1 2AA

 *Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail*

---

**From:** Councillor Steve Curran <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>  
**Sent:** 22 July 2021 11:39  
**To:** Norman Will (Will Norman, Walking & Cycling Commissioner) <[REDACTED]@tfl.gov.uk>  
**Cc:** Councillor Katherine Dunne <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Guy Lambert <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Hanif Khan <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>  
**Subject:** FW: C9 changes

Hi Will,

I know you're aware that Cabinet approved the C9 paper on Tuesday evening so its full steam ahead. Please see email below from [REDACTED] I would be most grateful if you could use your good offices to ensure that [REDACTED] suggestions are looked at seriously and if agreed the actions are implemented. Your feedback would be most welcome.

Best wishes

Cllr Steve Curran  
Leader of the Council

Cabinet Member for Corporate Strategy, Planning & Regeneration  
Labour Party Syon Ward  
[REDACTED]



---

**From:** Councillor Guy Lambert [REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>  
**Sent:** 22 July 2021 10:26  
**To:** Andrew Hatch [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Councillor Katherine Dunne [REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Hanif Khan <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Steve Curran [REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>  
**Subject:** FW: C9 changes

Maybe you can feed this in and get responses?  
G

---

**From:** [REDACTED]@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** 22 July 2021 09:40  
**To:** Councillor Katherine Dunne [REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Guy Lambert <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Hanif Khan [REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>; Councillor Steve Curran <[REDACTED]@hounslow.gov.uk>  
**Subject:** C9 changes

Well done councillors for holding the line on C9. Thank you.

A couple of things to ask TfL:

1. Replacement for the plane tree to be removed must not be one for one, but calculated according to CAVAT values (capital asset value for amenity trees). This provides a formula to calculate canopy etc value for a mature tree. I met with TfL designers 2 years ago and they agreed this. I have the precise values and the agreement on file if you need. It was more like 1 big tree, 8 new little ones.

2. Can the new bus stops on the floating islands have green roofs. Would be a real coup/feature.

many thanks

[REDACTED]